

## **Arbitration Case #5**

**Date: 2010**

### **Summary**

LIR F contested their RIPE NCC service fee for the billing year 2010 as they objected to being charged for Provider Independent (PI) space assigned to entities that they no longer considered as their customers. As a result, the case went to arbitration.

### **Details of Case**

Following ripe-452, “Contractual Requirements for Provider Independent Resources Holders in the RIPE NCC Service Region”, RIPE NCC members needed to identify PI address space associated with them. They had 3 options to choose from in terms of classifying this PI address space:

1. My infrastructure
2. My End User
3. Not My End User

The RIPE NCC sent a series of announcements to their members to notify them of the upcoming resource billing changes regarding PI address space. RIPE NCC Members were given until 20 September 2009 to identify all PI space that had previously been assigned to them using the three options above.

According to ripe-482, “RIPE NCC Charging Scheme 2010”, LIRs were to be charged 50 EUR for each PI resource associated with their LIR.

LIR F contacted the RIPE NCC in November 2009 to notify the latter that two of the PI resources associated with their LIR were actually associated with organisations which were no longer customers of LIR F.

### **Arbitration Ruling**

Although LIR F demonstrated that two of the three PI resources in dispute for billing purposes were associated with entities that were no longer their customer, they failed to do so before the deadline despite repeated and adequate warnings and requests for this information from the RIPE NCC. The Arbiter found that LIR was liable for the service fee of 50 EUR for each of these PI resources.

The third resource was found to be associated with LIR F’s own infrastructure and so the Arbiter found that LIR F should also pay 50 EUR for this.

In conclusion, the Arbiter found that LIR should be required to pay the outstanding 150 EUR for 2010. Provided this was paid within 30 days of the arbitration ruling, service to the LIR should continue.

